

Hellfire and Salvation: Useful Sources for a Study of Universal Salvation/ Ultimate Reconciliation by a Christian Historian

Judith Ann Benner, Ph.D.

[Complier's Note: Many other materials—for example the many writings of A.E. Knoch—could have been included in this list, which reflects those used in my own studies. The Internet has made available a multitude of books and articles difficult otherwise to obtain, and a regular check of one of the online mega bookstores reveals pertinent new publications on the topic of universal salvation coming off the presses with surprising frequency. Nevertheless, because of the considerations of time and space, I have had to limit my scope of investigation and the length of this selected bibliography. Most of the websites cited for resources below offer other materials for additional study and/or serve as links to other sites.]

BIOGRAPHIES

[Note: It is almost impossible to understand the development of later Christian theology and doctrine, particularly that of eschatology, without knowing something about the leading Bible scholars of the Patristic Age. Each of the following works is an excellent introduction to the lives, times, thinking, and theology of the given subjects as well as their contemporaries and later supporters and detractors.]

Brown, Peter. *Augustine of Hippo: A Biography*. New ed. with epilogue. Berkeley and Los Angeles: University of California Press, 2000. Chapters 32 and 33, “Julian of Eclanum” and “Predestination” especially give helpful insight into the views on eternal torment, the justice/wrath of God, infant damnation, and what amounts to double predestination by a church leader revered and reviled as both the father of western theology and the Inquisition.

Crouzel, Henri. *Origen*. Translated by A.S. Worrall. Edinburgh: T. & T. Clark, 1989. Origen (d. c. A.D. 254) has been anathematized as heretical and branded as the father of universalism. Chapter 13, “The Church of the Age to Come,” refutes the charge of invention and shows how Origen’s speculative thinking on last things was misunderstood, misquoted, mistranslated, and/or deliberately misrepresented.

[Note: Dates hereafter cited are all A.D.]

Kelly, J. N. D. *Jerome: His Life, Writings, and Controversies*. London: Gerald Duckworth & Co., 1975; reprint ed., Peabody, Mass.: Hendrickson Publishers, 1998. Jerome (d. 420) has been blamed for mistranslation of the Greek text in the Latin Vulgate, but his faults as a Bible translator and scholar exceeded even this charge. Has eye-opening critiques of Jerome’s New and Old Testament translations.

DEFINITIONS, DOCTRINES, AND DENIALS

Allen, Ken. “Christian Universalism: True Biblical Christianity.” 11 June 2004, available from <http://auburn.edu/~allenkc/truechr.html>. Part 2, “Christian Universalism as a Complete Biblical System of Faith,” lists an eleven-point creedal statement complete with Scriptural references.

----- . “What Is ‘Christian Universalism?’” 11 June 2004, available from <http://auburn.edu/~allenkc/chr-univ.html>. Defines Christian Universalism and differentiates it from what he calls “Pluralistic Universalism” (modern Unitarian Universalism), which he equates with secular humanism.

The Catholic Encyclopedia, Vol. I, 1907 ed. (Online ed., 1999). S.v. “Apocatastasis” by Pierre Batiffel. 18 July 2004, available at <http://www.newadvent.org/cathen/01599a.htm>. Blames the belief in universal restoration held by St. Gregory of Nyssa, Origen, and Clement of Alexandria on the influence of Platonism.

_____. Vol. XV, 1912 ed. (Online ed., 1999). S.v. “Universalists” by N.A. Weber. 18 July 2004, available at <http://www.newadvent.org/cathen/15181a.htm>. Deals with Universalism as a denomination.

Crockett, William. gen. ed. *Four Views on Hell*. Counterpoint Series. Grand Rapids, Mich.: Zondervan, 1996. Views proposed are literal, metaphorical, purgatorial, and conditional (annihilation), defended and responded to respectively by John F. Walvoord, Dallas Theological Seminary; William V. Crockett, Alliance Theological Seminary; Zachary J. Hayes, Catholic Theological Union; and Clark H. Pinnock, McMaster Divinity College. Succinct coverage (arguments average 28 pages, responses 12) of the four current majority views with a few scattered asides at universalism and universalists.

Fudge, Edward William, and Peterson, Robert A. *Two Views of Hell: A Biblical & Theological Debate*. Downers Grove, Ill.: InterVarsity Press, 2000. In this volume, Robert A. Peterson defends the traditional view of eternal damnation while Edward William Fudge proposes the conditional view of annihilation of the wicked. Author of the Introduction—identity not given—dismisses universalism as unbiblical.

Kelly, J.N.D. *Early Christian Doctrines*. Paperback Revised [5th ed]. New York: HarperCollins Publishers, HarperSanFrancisco, 1978. This prolific author of church biography and history devotes only one chapter (“The Christian Hope”) of 31 pages (out of 511) to last things and less than 2 pages to the fate of the wicked, i.e., eternal damnation. Kelly admits that the doctrine of eternal damnation did not gain ascendancy in the church until the fifth century and that even Basil and Augustine confessed that large numbers of Christians believed that God’s chastisement of the wicked was limited in duration.

Keeley, Robin, ed. *Eerdman’s Handbook to Christian Belief*. Grand Rapids, Mich.: William B. Eerdman’s Publishing Co., 1982. This work devotes six paragraphs of 460 pages of text (excluding Glossary, Index, and Acknowledgments) to universalism as a Christian belief. In this short article of six paragraphs by Tokunboh Adeyemo, two sentences explain—extremely briefly—the belief that since Christ died for all, all should be saved. The rest of the section is devoted to condemning these tenets as being unbiblical because they overlook repentance and faith; deny free will, the separation of the sheep and goats, the reality of heaven and hell as actual places; and the two destinies taught by the Rich Man and Lazarus; hamper Christian evangelism; and undermine the practice of holiness.

Kvanig, Jonathan L. *The Problem of Hell*. Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1993. Admits that traditional Christian doctrines of hell are inadequate, denies that hell is retributive, and maintains that God’s love for His creatures extends human free will to the point that He will in love allow sinners to go to hell if that is what they really want.

The New Schaff-Herzog Encyclopedia of Religious Knowledge. Vol. I, 1951. “Apocatastasis” by Clarence Augustine Beckwith. 16 July 2004, available from <http://www.ccel.org/php/disp.php?authorID=schaff&bookID=encyc01&page=210>.

Objective thumbnail sketch, bringing the history of the doctrine from the early fathers through the Middle Ages and Reformation down to the end of the nineteenth century. Includes important defenders of the doctrine as well as their best-known works.

_____. Vol. XII, 1950. "Universalists" by George T. Knight. 17 June 2004, available from <http://www.ccel.org/php/disp.php?authorID=schaff&bookID=encyc12&page=95>. Considers doctrine and organization, admits the Eastern Church as a whole was universalist until the sixth century, examines the Universalist Church in America, and lists works by those defending, those questioning, and those attacking universalism.

Shedd, William G.T. *The Doctrine of Eternal Punishment*. New York: Charles Scribner's Sons, 1886. Described by George T. Knight (above) as "leaves nothing to be desired in behalf of its subject [the actuality of eternal damnation]," this full-length study was written by the Roosevelt Professor of Systematic Theology at the Union Theological Seminary. Good source for the traditional point of view, but is dominated by the author's dogmatic mindset and his position that Scripture (for example, those verses containing words like *aiōnios*) can only be rightly interpreted by accepted theology. His final argument (in the Preface) against universal salvation is to ask what would happen to Christian liturgical and devotional literature if it is true that all men will be saved.

HISTORIES

Amirault, Gary. "The Early Christian View of the Savior." 14 July 2004, available from <http://www.tentmaker.org/books/EarlyChristianView.html>. Quotes from the early fathers showing their beliefs in ultimate, universal reconciliation and/or limited chastisement and from eminent historians on the early fathers, and lists seventy-five pertinent Scriptures, many of them dealing with God's plans for "all."

Beecher, Edward. *History of Opinions on the Scriptural Doctrine of Retribution*. New York: D. Appleton & Co., 1878. 13 June 2004, available from <http://www.tentmaker.org/books/DoctrineOfRetribution.html>. Detailed study of Old Testament and Christian era doctrines from Scripture and extra-Biblical sources. Notes that despite attempts by Shedd (above) in an 1865 study of Christian doctrine and others to claim eternal damnation as the oldest and most widespread doctrine of the church, the evidence of the oldest creeds, the earliest councils, and the teachings of four out of six theological schools prove universalism was the accepted doctrine of the church before the sixth century.

Bernstein, Alan E. *The Formation of Hell*. Ithaca, N.Y.: Cornell University Press, 1993. A detailed study of ideas of the afterlife in ancient Babylon, Egypt, Greece, Rome, and Israel, all of which had influence on the Mediterranean culture in which Christianity was born. Punishment after death developed in Egypt rather than Mesopotamia; parallels to hell, heaven, and purgatory are found in Plato; other Greek writers as well as the Romans admitted the usefulness of eternal damnation as a social control; while in Israel, the concept of punishment and reward after death developed long after the giving of the Mosaic Law. Also contains a section on eternal damnation vs. universal salvation in the early church through the time of Augustine.

Chadwick, Henry. *The Early Church*. Rev. ed. New York: Penguin Books, 1993. Excellent historical survey of the period, introducing personalities, doctrines, liturgy, controversies, schisms, persecutions, and heresies.

Davis, Leo Donald. *The First Seven Ecumenical Councils (325-787): Their History and Theology*. Wilmington, Del.: M. Glazier, 1983; reprint ed., Colledgeville, Minn.: Liturgical Press, 1990. Gives the political as well as religious backgrounds of the first seven ecumenical

councils. Devotes 51 pages of text to the Second Council of Constantinople (553), but does not mention universalism as one of the reasons for Origen's anathematization.

Eusebius. *The History of the Church from Christ to Constantine*. Translated by G. A. Williamson. New York: Penguin Books, 1989. Interesting for what persons and movements the author (d. c. 340) considered (and did not consider, like Origen) heretical.

Hanson, J[ohn] W[esley]. *Universalism the Prevailing Doctrine of the Christian Church During Its First Five Hundred Years*. Boston and Chicago: Universalist Publishing House, 1899. 14 July 2004, available from <http://www.tentmaker.org/books/Prevailing.html>. A full-length study using not only the writings of the early church fathers themselves but those of "distinguished modern writers" including scholars, historians, and critics. Contains numerous quotes from works now difficult to obtain and gives footnotes at the ends of the chapters. Final chapter (23) contains thirty-one conclusions drawn from the study.

L'Huillier, Peter. *The Church of the Ancient Councils: The Disciplinary Work of the First Four Ecumenical Councils*. Crestwood, N.Y.: St Vladimir's Seminary Press, 2000. Covers the Councils of Nicea I, Constantinople I, Ephesus, and Chalcedon (325-451) and shows what leaders of the church during this period actually considered heretical. (It wasn't universal salvation.)

Schaff, Philip. *History of the Christian Church*. Vol. 2: *Ante-Nicene Christianity, A.D. 100-325*. New York: Charles Scribner's Sons, 1910. reprint ed. Grand Rapids, Mich.: Wm. B. Eerdmans Publishing Co., 1995. A detailed study with copious notes and references, good for background and source materials. A staunch supporter of eternal damnation. Schaff admits that although considered a heresy since 543, universalism is "tolerated in Protestant churches as a private speculative opinion or charitable hope" (p. 612).

Thayer, Thomas B. *The Origin and History of the Doctrine of Endless Punishment*. 2nd ed. Boston: Universalist Publishing House, 1871. 17 June 2004, available from <http://www.tentmaker.org/books/OriginandHistory.html>. First published in 1855, this work maintains that the doctrine of endless punishment did not come from divine inspiration but rather can be traced to heathen foundations. Especially useful are Chapter 3, "Endless Punishment of Heathen Origin," which lists quotes from ancient pagan writers on why society required terrorizing the masses with punishments after death and Chapter 6, "The Introduction of the Doctrine into the Christian Church," which traces its chronology from the death of the Apostle John to Tertullian (c. 220).

RESTITUTION OF ALL THINGS/RESTORATION

Allin, Thomas. *Christ Triumphant; or Universalism Asserted as the Hope of the Gospel on the Authority of Reason, the Fathers, and Holy Scripture*. 9th ed. Canyon Country, Ca.: Concordant Publishing Concern, n.d. Cites at least seventeen early church fathers, extending from Clement of Rome (c. 95) to Theodoret of Cyprus (c. 427) who believed in universal salvation, ultimate restoration, the annulment of evil, and/or correctional chastisement of limited duration.

Bonda, Jan. *The One Purpose of God: An Answer to the Doctrine of Eternal Punishment*. Foreword by Sierd Woudstra. Translated by Reinder Bruinsma. Grand Rapids, Mich.: William B. Eerdmans Publishing Co., 1998. This retired pastor (d. 1997) of the Reformed Church in the Netherlands urges his readers not to acquiesce in the damnation of souls because God wills all men to be saved and uses detailed exegesis, particularly of Paul's writings in the Book of Romans, to prove his conclusions.

[Note: The following fifteen-part Bible study first appeared in the Saviour of the World series of monthly newsletters from The Kingdom Bible Studies Ministries. As the individual titles indicate, these thought-provoking lessons cover a wide range of topics in the general field of reconciliation and bring an added dimension to the truth that Jesus Christ really is the Saviour of the World.]

- Eby, J. Preston. "Just what do you mean...ETERNITY." The Saviour of the World Series. 17 July 2004, available from http://godfire.net/eby/eternity_eby.html. Includes studies on God's plan for the ages, the Age of the Ages, the life of the ages, time and eternity, and ages-lasting correction.
- _____. "Just what do you mean...GOD ALL IN ALL?" The Saviour of the World Series. 17 July 2004, available from <http://godfire.net/eby/allinall.html>. Includes studies on God's purpose for this age, two-part redemption, all men dying in Adam and being made alive in Christ, every man coming in his own order, all things being in subjection, and God becoming all in all.
- _____. "Just what do you mean...GOD IS LOVE." The Saviour of the World Series. 17 July 2004, available from <http://godfire.net/eby/EBgodislove.html>. Includes studies on God being love, the power of God's love, loving our enemies, and knowing the real Jesus.
- _____. "Just what do you mean...GOD WILL HAVE ALL MEN BE SAVED." The Saviour of the World Series. 17 July 2004, available from <http://godfire.net/eby/godwill3.html>. Includes studies on God having all men to be saved, Christ's drawing all men unto Himself, God's oath to save all, the justification of all mankind, having mercy upon all, and why we should teach salvation for all.
- _____. "Just what do you mean...HELL." The Saviour of the World Series. 17 July 2004, available from <http://godfire.net/eby/EBhell.html>. Includes studies on infinite grace, a "second chance," the Hadean state, Christ preaching in hell, punishment fitting the crime, the Good Shepherd, and the great gulf of Dives and Lazarus.
- _____. "Just what do you mean...JUBILEE." The Saviour of the World Series. 17 July 2004, available from <http://godfire.net/eby/EBjubilee.html>. Includes studies on the year of Jubilee, the inheritance and that inheritance lost, redemption, redemption vs. Jubilee, limited redemption, Jubilee, and trumpets and the Jubilee.
- _____. "Just what do you mean...THE JUDGMENT." The Saviour of the World Series. 17 July 2004, available from <http://godfire.net/eby/judgment.html>. Includes studies on judgments past and future, judgments of believers and nations, the true nature of judgment, God's purpose for the church, judgment and restoration, Judgment Day, and the ministry of judging, redemption, and restoration.
- _____. "Just what do you mean...THE LAKE OF FIRE." The Saviour of the World Series. 17 July 2004, available from <http://godfire.net/eby/EBlake.html>. Includes studies on the Prodigal Son, the Lake of Fire and the Second Death, not being hurt of the Second Death, and being tormented in the presence of the Lamb.
- _____. "Just what do you mean...THE LAW OF CIRCULARITY." The Saviour of the World Series. 17 July 2004, available from <http://godfire.net/eby/EBcircularity.html>. Includes studies on the question of Jesus torturing billions forever, on how men are saved, and on the Law of Circularity.
- _____. "Just what do you mean...MAN IS A FREE MORAL AGENT?" The Saviour of the World Series. 17 July 2004, available from <http://godfire.net/eby/freeagent.htm>. Includes

studies on man being a free moral agent, the sinner deciding, the shepherd seeking the sheep, the will of man, Jesus drawing all men unto Himself, and Jesus being the only truly free moral agent.

- _____. “Just what do you mean...RECONCILIATION.” The Saviour of the World Series. 17 July 2004, available from <http://godfire.net/eby/reconciliation.html>. Includes studies on reconciling man to God, reconciling all things, and the ministry of reconciliation.
- _____. “Just what do you mean...RECONCILIATION IN THE HEAVENS.” The Saviour of the World Series. 17 July 2004, available from <http://godfire.net/eby/EBreconcilehvns.html>. A study of the reconciliation of principalities and powers.
- _____. “Just what do you mean...THE RESTITUTION OF ALL THINGS.” The Saviour of the World Series. 17 July 2004, available from <http://godfire.net/eby/restitution.html>. Includes studies on there being one God, all things being created by Him and in Christ, all things coming out of Him, all things being through Him, all things returning into Him, and total restitution.
- _____. “Just what do you mean...THE UNPARDONABLE SIN.” The Saviour of the World Series. 17 July 2004, available from <http://godfire.net/eby/EBunpardonable.html>. Includes studies on what the “unpardonable” sin is, how it cannot be forgiven to the age, and how that day of forgiveness is dawning.
- _____. “Just what do you mean...THE WAGES OF SIN IS DEATH.” The Saviour of the World Series. 17 July 2004, available from <http://godfire.net/eby/EBwages.html>. Includes studies on the wages of sin truly being death and Jesus truly being the Saviour of the World.

Foster, J.V. *Restitution: All, or Nothing at All*. 2nd ed. San Antonio, Tex.: Bethesda Christian Institute, 1997. Since God is the creator and owner of all things, all things will return to Him. What all mankind lost in Adam’s fall will be restored in Christ through the sacrifice of Calvary and the resurrection of Our Lord.

Hanson, J[ohn] W[esley]. *Bible Proofs of Universal Salvation; Containing the Principal Passages of Scripture that Teach the Final Holiness and Happiness of All Mankind*. 7th ed. Boston: Universalist Publishing House, 1888. 17 June 2004, available from <http://www.tentmaker.org/books/Bibleproofs2.html>. Covers among many others such topics as God’s silence; the punishment of Adam and Cain; the promises to Adam, Abraham, and the obedient; God’s anger limited but mercy unlimited; testimony of the prophets; the word Gospel; the Lord’s Prayer; the nature of punishment; God’s attributes, power, wisdom, and love unlimited; Paul’s hope; what God will and will not do; why Paul was persecuted; and the final consummation. [Note: This work was reprinted by the Kessinger Publishing Company in 2003.]

Hawtin, George. *The Restitution of All Things*. 10 June 2004, available from <http://thekingdomofgod.tripod.com/hawtin.htm>. Hard copy versions available from various sources. A short, basic study of the wider view of salvation beginning with an exposition of Acts 3:21. Deals with God’s plan and purpose for the ages and the restoration of all things in the Kingdom of God.

Hodges, Larry and Betty. *The All-Encompassing Work of Christ*. 10 June 2004, available from <http://www.sigler.org/shofar/aewc.htm>. First portion of this work consists of detailed answers to objections raised against the doctrine of the ultimate salvation of all.

- Hurley, Loyal F. *The Outcome of Infinite Grace*. n.p., n.d. 23 July 2004, available from <http://www.godstruthfortoday.org/Library/miscellaneous/TheOutcomeOfInfiniteGrace.htm>. This Seventh Day Baptist minister shows fresh (and refreshing) ways of looking at the questions and objections dealing with universal salvation. Going into such topics as the apparent confusion in Scripture over the three fates of the wicked, Christianity's false ideas of God, the origin of sin, and who is responsible for Adam's fall, he also gives creative answers to the five types of objections, including an explanation of the Dives and Lazarus parable which is as unusual as it is satisfying.
- Jenke, Albert E. *God's Ultimate Intention: Will He in Fact Be All-in-All?* 20 June 2004, available from <http://www.totlogcon/universl.htm>. A compilation of various writers on the topic, including Andrew Jukes, William Law, A.E. Knoch, and Thomas Allin. Outline section contains Scripture references, some with Strong's Concordance numbers, dealing with the ages in Scripture; free will vs. God's sovereignty; hell, sheol, and hades; immortality; judgment; things hard to understand, and the redemption of all creation.
- Jones, Stephen E. *Creation's Jubilee*. Fridley, Minn.: God's Kingdom Ministries, 1991. 4th rev. ed., 1999. Expands coverage of reconciliation begun in *The Sovereignty of God and the Destiny of Man* (below), showing the divine plan of the ages in the salvation of all mankind. Exceptionally good on Old Testament types of restoration and restitution found in the Mosaic Law, particularly the three harvest festivals (Passover, Pentecost, and Tabernacles), the law of Jubilee, and God's laws on liability.
- _____. and Wark, Micheal. *The Sovereignty of God and the Destiny of Man*. Phoenix, Ariz.: America's Promise, 1979. God's sovereignty as it relates to the ultimate restoration of the world. God is totally sovereign as well as totally just and allows temporary injustice (evil) which He will make right at the time of restitution of all things. Contains a 30-page historical survey of the doctrine of reconciliation including many quotes from the Patristic writers and a list of the teachers of universal reconciliation from the early church to mid-twentieth century.
- Jukes, Andrew. *The Second Death and the Restitution of all Things: With Some Preliminary Remarks on the Nature and Inspiration of Holy Scripture*. 14th ed. London: Longmans, Green, & Co., 1891; reprint ed. Corona, Ca.: Scripture Studies Concern, 1969. First published in 1867 by a then member of the Plymouth Brethren, showing the remedial work of Christ using death and judgment through successive ages to indeed bring all men to the Father. Reconciles the prophetic assertions of Scripture concerning the final restitution of all things with those seemingly contradictory Scriptures used to prove eternal damnation, considers and answers the three kinds of popular objections to this doctrine, and concludes that our views of God react upon ourselves. A classic.
- Klassen, Randolph J. (Randy). *What Does the Bible Really Say About Hell?: Wrestling with the Traditional View*. Foreword by Robert K. Johnson. Living Issues Discussion Series, vol. 2. Telford, Pa.: Pandora Press U.S., 2001. This highly readable book of 144 pages covers hell in the apostolic preaching, in the Hebrew Bible, and in the Gospels as well as judgment as presented in the Epistles. Also considers origins of the belief, problems of literal interpretation, rejection of traditional belief, standards of judgment, and future victory through Christ. Excellent introduction to universal salvation.
- Parry, Robin A. and Partridge, Christopher H., eds. *Universal Salvation? The Current Debate*. Foreword by Gabriel Fackre. Grand Rapids, Mich.: William B. Eerdmans Publishing Co., 2004. Philosopher Thomas Talbott defends Christian universalism against its evangelical critics. Two chapters ("Universalism in the History of Christianity" and "Universalistic Trends in the Evangelical Tradition: An Historical Perspective") by other authors give needed background. Contains 18-page bibliography.

Pearson, Carlton D. "God Is Not a Christian." 23 July 2004, available from <http://www.higherd.org/htm/gnac.htm>. The first two chapters of Bishop Pearson's forthcoming work introducing his "Doctrine of Inclusion"—the belief that Jesus Christ truly is the Savior of all the world—which he is preaching on television and radio as well as in evangelistic campaigns. Includes a short description of his spiritual journey to this belief and an assertion that Christians have perceived and presented God as an abusive father who has to be placated by Jesus rather than as a loving Father who spared no pains, including the death of His Son on the Cross, in order to reclaim His children from loss and ruin.

Pridgeon, Charles H. *Is Hell Eternal or Will God's Plan Fail?* 3rd ed. Pittsburgh, Pa.: Evangelization Society of the Pittsburgh Bible Institute, 1931. 17 June 2004, available from <http://www.godstruthfortoday.org/Library/pridgeon/IsHellEternal000.htm>. Written by the president and founder of the Pittsburgh Bible Institute for the "thoughtful man or woman who has difficulty with the doctrine of endless punishment as usually taught (Preface)." Topics include (among others) eternity and time, hades, the Lake of Fire and brimstone, the problem of evil, a "sane and scriptural" doctrine of punishment, unpardonable sins, the love and unselfishness of God, the purpose in death, the final permanence of character, and limitations of human freedom.

Prinzing, Ray. *Redemption...All in All*. Boise, Idaho. By the Author, n.d. Shows by the Scriptures that the plan of God includes the return, redemption, and restoration of all fallen humanity.

Talbott, Thomas. *The Inescapable Love of God*. Rev. prtng. N.p.: Universal Publishers/uPUBLISH.com, 2002. Another excellent introduction by a professor of philosophy. Part I considers the fear of hell and its legacy in western theology; Part II contends universal reconciliation is clearly taught in the New Testament, especially in the universalism of St. Paul; and Part III examines the logical inconsistencies found in Augustinian and Arminian theology concerning Divine love, Divine justice, Divine omnipotence, evil, free will, and human suffering.

ROMAN CATHOLIC, GREEK ORTHODOX

[Note: Although the following authors deny the anathematized doctrine of *apocatastasis*, they themselves and their churches are at least open to the hope of the salvation of all men.]

Balthasar, Hans Urs von. *Dare We Hope "That All Men Be Saved"?: With a Short Discourse on Hell*. Translated by Dr. David Kipp and Rev. Lothar Krauth. San Francisco: Ignatius Press, 1988. A former Jesuit and leading Catholic theologian (d. 1988), Balthasar concludes from the witness of Scripture, the writings of the Patristic Fathers, the studies of other Catholic theologians, and the testimonies of the saints and mystics that Christians have the duty of both hoping for and praying for the salvation of all men.

K_{ng}, Hans. *Eternal Life? Life After Death as a Medical, Philosophical, and Theological Problem*. Translated by Edward Quinn. Garden City, N. Y.: Doubleday & Co., 1984. In Chapter 6, "Between Heaven and Hell," this maverick Catholic theologian questions the doctrine of eternal damnation in literal fire, notes hell does not appear in the earliest Christian creeds, and reminds his readers of New Testament texts which suggest the salvation of all.

Ware, Kallistos. *The Collected Works*. Vol. 1: *The Inner Kingdom*. Crestwood, N. Y.: St Vladimir's Seminary Press, 2000. In his chapter "Dare We Hope for the Salvation of All?" Greek Orthodox Bishop Ware admits universalist passages of Scripture; discusses the

universalism of Origen, St. Gregory of Nyssa (who was never anathematized for his belief), and St. Isaac the Syrian; and quotes St. Silouan of Mount Athos that we must pray for all.

SCRIPTURE/WORD/MISCELLANEOUS STUDIES

- Abbott, Louis. *An Analytical Study of Words*. n.p. n.d. 14 July 2004, available from <http://www.tentmaker.org/books/asw/index.html>. This extensive study of the Hebrew and Greek words which have been translated as everlasting, eternal, age, forever and ever, hell, grave, judgment, destruction, and damnation is the result of fifty years of scholarly endeavor by a former pastor who left the ministry when he realized his denomination's doctrine of eternal damnation was in error. Available in hard copy 2004 edition from Tentmaker.
- Amirault, Gary. *Bible Translations That Do Not Teach Eternal Torment*. 17 June 2004, available from <http://www.tentmaker.org/books/GatesOfHell.html>. Those looking for a new translation study Bible will find this web booklet by the founder of Tentmaker Ministries extremely helpful. Amirault compares numerous translations on key Scriptures dealing with hell and everlasting punishment. For those who are KJV-only adherents, he suggests an excellent, yet readily available KJV reference Bible.
- _____. "Does 'foreverS AND everS' Make Sense to You?" 17 June 2004, available from <http://www.what-the-hell-is-hell.com/HellStudy/forever.htm>. Brief study on the use of "forever and ever" in the KJV and other translations.
- _____. "Eternal Death (Annihilation): One Step Out of Hell; One Step Short of Glory." 17 June 2004, available from <http://www.tentmaker.org/books/EternalDeath.html>. Examines New Testament words which have been used by the advocates of conditional immortality to teach the doctrine of annihilation.
- _____. "Etymology of the Word 'Damn.'" 17 June 2004, available from <http://www.what-the-hell-is-hell.com/HellEncyclopedia/WordDamn.htm>. An eye-opening study.
- _____. "Hell Is Leaving the Bible 'forever.'" 13 June 2004, available from [http://www.tentmaker.org/articles/Hell is Leaving the Bible Forever.html](http://www.tentmaker.org/articles/Hell%20is%20Leaving%20the%20Bible%20Forever.html). Shows the number of times the word "hell" appears in the KJV and thirty-nine other translations. Also includes exposition of Scriptures using words relating to eternity and a list of materials available on the Tentmaker website.
- _____. "The Power of Life and Death in a Greek Four Letter Word—Aion." 17 June 2004, available from <http://www.tentmaker.org/books/PowerOfLifeAndDeathInAGreekFourLetterWord.html>. Deals with the *olam/aion/aionios* question as well as the "unpardonable" sin and includes a section on history of the doctrine of eternal torment.
- Hanson, John Wesley. *The Bible Hell: The words hell in the bible, sheol, hadees, tartarus, and gehenna, shown to denote a state of temporal duration. All the texts containing the word examined and explained in harmony with the doctrine of universal salvation*. 4th ed. Boston: Universalist Publishing House, 1888. 17 June 2004, available from <http://www.tentmaker.org/books/TheBibleHell.html>. Examines the English word hell, the words sheol and hadees in the Old Testament and hadees and gehenna and tartarus in the New Testament, and maintains that hadees, the real hell, will be destroyed once it has accomplished its God-given purpose of reformation.

- _____. *Bible Threatenings Explained; or, Passages of Scripture Sometimes Quoted to Prove Endless Punishment Shown to Teach Consequences of Limited Duration*. N.p., n.d. 17 June 2004, available from <http://www.tentmaker.org/books/BibleThreateningsExplained.html>. Shows that the numerous threatenings of Scripture harmonize with the promises of the Scripture and that the threatenings are given to bring about fulfillment of the promises.
- _____. *The Greek Word AIÓN—AIÓNIOS, Translated Everlasting—Eternal in the Holy Bible, Shown to Denote Limited Duration*. Chicago: Northwestern Universalist Publishing House, 1875. 17 June 2004, available from http://www.tentmaker.org/books/Aion_lim.html. Covers history and use of the word *Ai_n* and its derivatives, showing that the original Greek offers no support to the doctrine of eternal damnation.
- Slagle, Charles. *Absolute Assurance in Jesus Christ: Four Views of the Salvation of Our God*. Edited by Robin Philips. N.p., 1998. 17 June 2004, available from <http://tentmaker.org/books/Absolute-Assurance-in-JesusChrist.html>. Looks at the four views of the Good News of Jesus Christ: The Good News of Once Saved, Hardly Saved (Arminianism); The Good News of Once Saved, Always Saved (Calvinism); The Good News of Once Saved, Nearly Always Saved (Calv-Arminianism); and The Good News of Christ's Total Victory. Includes appendices covering fourteen common objections and questions and thirty-five negative proofs against God's love and sovereignty and the totality of Christ's atonement if Christ does not finally lead all to repentance.
- Thomas, A.C. "Questions Without Answers." 11 June 2004, available from <http://www.auburn.edu/~allenkc/answers.html>. Asks 213 questions, many with Scripture references, about God's love, sovereignty, justice, wisdom, intentions, will, mercy, goodness, salvation, rewards, and punishments which cannot be answered correctly by those with a limited view of that salvation.
- Vincent, Marvin R. "Note on Olethron Aionion (eternal destruction)." 13 June 2004, available from <http://www.tentmaker.org/articles/aionole.htm>. An interesting word study from a scholar who was Baldwin Professor of Sacred Literature at the Union Theological Seminary in New York at the time his multi-volume *Word Studies in the New Testament* was published. Notes among other things that *aion/aionios* cannot mean eternal or everlasting because there is a totally different Greek word for that concept and that *olethros/apollumi* do not always mean irrevocable destruction.
- Whittemore, Thomas. "100 Scriptural Proofs That Jesus Christ Will Save All Mankind." 17 June 2004, available from <http://tentmaker.org/books/ScripturalProofs.html>. Written in 1840, this study gives Scripture citations under the following headings: God the Creator of Men, God the Father of Men, and God the Lord, or Owner of Men; All Men Committed to Christ's Care; The Nature of God, the Wisdom of God, the Pleasure of God, the Promises of God, the Oath of God, and the Power of God; the Death of Christ; and the Testimony of the Prophets, the Testimony of Jesus, the Testimony of Peter, and the Testimony of Paul.

TESTIMONIES AND VISIONARIES

- Fox, John. *Today, Tomorrow and the Great Beyond: 7,000 Years from Adam, Followed by the Great Post-Millennial Age*. 2nd. ed. Vancouver, B.C.: Association of the Covenant People, 1948. Originally published as *God's Great Week* in 1939, this work focuses mainly on Biblical history, chronology, and prophecy, but includes a section "The Triumphant

Victory of Jesus Christ” listing Scriptures pertaining to all men, every man, all things, all families, the world, the whole world, and creation. Notes God will yet deliver His entire creation according to Romans 8:21.

Law, William. *An Humble, Affectionate, and Earnest Address to the Clergy*. London: M. Richardson, 1761. 22 July 2004, available from <http://www.passtheword.org/DIALOGS-FROM-THE-PAST/clergy.htm>. English mystic and author of numerous devotional books (d.1761) who influenced John and Charles Wesley and the Methodist movement. The love of the Divine nature which brought forth all things is not changed by sin, but rather continually works to restore all sinners to their first state of goodness. God’s wrath is the purifying fire which restores the fallen creature to its first union with God, and the ages of chastisement will last only until sin is purged and all redeemed. Andrew Murray (below) edited many of Law’s books.

Lead, Jane. *The Enochian Walks with God, Found out by a Spiritual-Traveller, Whose Face Towards Mount-Sion Above was Set. With An Experimental Account of what was Known, Seen, and met withal there*. London: D. Edwards, 1694. 23 July 2004, available from <http://www.passtheword.org/Jane-Lead/enocwalk.htm>. Described by the author, an English mystic (d. 1704), whose works may have influenced William Law (above) as a “further Revelation of an Immense and Infinite Latitude of GOD’S Love, to the Restoring of His whole Creation.” God will not only save and deliver fallen mankind from an endless punishment, but will restore them all by a total renovation of soul. “The Plaster provided, is much broader than what the Wound of Sin hath made.”

_____. *A Revelation of the Everlasting Gospel-Message, Which shall never cease to be Preach’d Till the Hour of Christ’s Eternal Judgment Shall Come: Whereby will be Proclaim’d the Last-Love Jubilee, in order to the Restitution of the Whole Lapsed Creation, Whether Human or Angelical. When by the Blood of the Everlasting Covenant, All Prisoners shall be set free*. London: n.p., 1697. 23 July 2004, available from <http://www.passtheword.org/Jane-Lead/gospel.htm>. Relates her own spiritual journey from refusal to believe in such a wideness of God’s love to the acceptance of universal salvation of men and angels and answers questions and objections raised by her *Enochian Walks with God*.

Murray, Andrew. *God’s Will: Our Dwelling Place*. 14 June 2004, chapter 23 available from <http://www.savior-of-all.com/murray.html>. Hard copy edition reprinted by Whitaker House in 2002. Murray, a Dutch Reformed minister from South Africa (d.1917) known for his revival ministry and ever-popular books on the deeper spiritual life (240 in all) wrote in chapter 23 (“The Salvation of All”) that God is love, His will is love, He wills all to be saved, and we must do the will that wills that all men should be saved.

Smith, Hannah Whitall. *The Unselfishness of God and How I Discovered It, a Spiritual Autobiography*. London: Fleming H. Revell Co., 1903. 14 June 2004, chapters 21-23 available from <http://www.godstruthfortoday.org/Library/smith/hwsmith9.html>. Quaker holiness revivalist who also wrote the perennially popular (and widely selling) *The Christian’s Secret of a Happy Life* (1875). Included in her autobiography are three chapters (21-23) in which she details her departure from the doctrine of eternal torment and acceptance of ultimate reconciliation. According to Gary Amirault, when this work was reprinted by Littlebrook Publishing, these crucial chapters were eliminated.